# **APPENDIX 1**

# **Active Travel Officer Support – Options Appraisal**

# Set up an embedded role through Sustrans' Partnerships offer

#### **Benefits**

- Existing partnerships across Essex and Hertfordshire;
- Existing model of embedding Active Travel Officers across the UK who are specifically trained to work in Local Authorities;
- Guaranteed delivery of a suitable candidate through various recruitment portals
- Wide recruitment field and high profile means Sustrans can access skills and talent through potentially unconventional Local Authority routes;
- Demonstrable cross sector partnership working that will align policy aims and funding streams to improve the delivery and impact of common goals;
- Sustrans commit to providing their officers a highly-regarded training package alongside a range of training and knowledge sharing opportunities for the Local Authority partners;
- HGGT team able to access the range of support available from the wider Sustrans network and expertise. This includes specialist advice on:
  - o design and engineering,
  - monitoring and evaluation,
  - infrastructure project management,
  - development of Active Travel Strategies,
  - o community engagement, and,
  - behaviour change techniques.
- Provides HGGT access to Sustrans' existing partnerships with a wide network of organisations and sustainable transport professionals across the country who are allied to Sustrans' core charitable mission to make it easier for people to walk and cycle (particularly those in the Walking and Cycling Alliance);
- Provides HGGT access to a range of volunteers through their Volunteer Programme;
- Sustrans' offer is deemed good value, due to their charitable status, rather than a private consultancy, which is in line with appropriate use of public money;
- Removes HR responsibilities from the Councils for the selected candidate.

Their current work in Essex and Hertfordshire includes:

- The Winstree Road community-led street design project, Colchester (commissioned by Essex County Council) which started in April 2019. Within this two-year project, they are engaging and enabling residents, pupils, teachers, councillors and other users of the area around Winstree Road to have a say on how their streets can be improved. There are already three schools on Winstree Road, with a fourth due to open in September 2019. The project therefore has a particular focus on reducing traffic volumes and speeds, particularly at school drop-off and pick-up times, so that it is safer and easier for pupils to travel to school actively. The project will involve temporarily trialling alterations and the development of longer-term solutions.
- Development of a signage strategy and initial designs for improvements to cycle routes in and around Southend-on-Sea (commissioned by Southend Borough Council in 2018).
- Delivery of their two-day **Better By Design training course for Hertfordshire County Council** (in 2018).
- Ongoing support of approximately 80 Sustrans volunteers across Essex and Hertfordshire.
- Undertaking a feasibility study for improving the cycle route between Redbourn and Harpenden (to be delivered this financial year, for Highways England).

In recent years in Essex and Hertfordshire, they have also:

- Delivered the flagship **Bike It schools engagement** project, based out of Hadleigh Park (2015 to 2018).
- Coordinated the Eco-Race schools **active travel competition** across Essex (to 2018).
- Coordinated the Cake Escape, a reward scheme to encourage residents and visitors to Essex to get out on their bikes, explore the local countryside, and enjoy some tea and cake at participating cafes and coffee shops. They set up and ran this initiative from 2014 and transferred its delivery over to Essex County Council in 2018.

### **Disadvantages**

More expensive for an individual officer than directly recruiting

	through the previous HGGT route;							
•	Council	resource	required	to	waive	the	standard	procurement
	route.							

Option	Benefits / Disadvantages					
Instruct external Private Consultants to complete the works required through a Direct Award	<ul> <li>Benefits</li> <li>External consultants would provide immediate resource by applying much of their existing experience from elsewhere, therefore limiting the time spent by the HGGT team and Local Authority staff on training and integrating new staff;</li> <li>There would be no need to go through another recruitment drive, avoiding a likely delay of at least 8-10 weeks;</li> <li>There's potential to recruit individuals with particularly relevant expertise to each of the Active Travel demands;</li> <li>The Council would benefit from a consultant's experience of working with other local authorities and government agencies;</li> <li>Disadvantages</li> <li>There would inevitably be an inflated cost attached to consultancy work;</li> <li>Involves additional council resource to waive the standard procurement route;</li> <li>Another consultancy would not necessarily have the local connections provided by Sustrans based on their work elsewhere across Essex;</li> <li>There is loss of continuity for HGGT if consultants are a short-term solution, or if different consultants are brought in for different aspects of the Active Travel packages (e.g. behaviour change, infrastructure design, strategic planning etc.);</li> <li>Embedded knowledge within the wider team is not guaranteed following the contract term.</li> </ul>					
Instruct alternative charity/ organisation/ cycling lobby to complete the works required through a Direct Award	<ul> <li>Options Explored:         <ul> <li>Cycling UK and London Cycling Campaign and British Cycling – focus on cycling, and not necessarily walking/placemaking</li> <li>Living Streets and Ramblers – focus on walking specifically</li> <li>Campaign for Better Transport and Transport for Quality of Life – more focus on campaigning and unlikely to have capacity to deliver resource</li> </ul> </li> <li>Benefits</li> </ul>					
	External organisations would provide immediate resource by					

- applying much of their existing experience and expertise, therefore limiting the time spent on training and integrating new staff;
- There would be no need to go through another recruitment drive, avoiding a likely delay at least 8-10 weeks;
- There's potential to involve individuals or various organisations with particularly relevant expertise to each of the key requirements;
- Potentially provides access to existing partnerships with a wide network of organisations and sustainable transport professionals across the country;

# Disadvantages

- Sustrans is deemed to have a unique breadth of experience and reputation across walking, cycling and placemaking to source and support a suitable candidate for this role, which has not been identified elsewhere;
- Involves additional council resource to waive the standard procurement route;
- Another consultancy would not necessarily have the local connections provided by Sustrans based on their work elsewhere across Essex;
- There is loss of continuity for HGGT if consultants are just a shortterm solution, or if different consultants are brought in for different aspects of the Active Travel packages (e.g. behaviour change, infrastructure design, strategic planning etc.);
- Embedded knowledge within the wider team is not guaranteed following the contract term.

# Invite tenders to complete the works required.

# **Benefits**

- The procurement process would open out the options to a potentially more competitive pool;
- External organisations would provide immediate resource by applying much of their existing experience and expertise, therefore limiting the time spent on training and integrating new staff;
- There would be no need to go through another recruitment drive, avoiding a likely delay at least 8-10 weeks;
- There's potential to involve individuals or various organisations with particularly relevant expertise to each of the key requirements;
- Potentially provides access to existing partnerships with a wide network of organisations and sustainable transport professionals across the country;

## **Disadvantages**

• Sustrans is deemed to have a unique breadth of experience and

reputation across walking, cycling and placemaking to source and support a suitable candidate for this role, which is unlikely to be matched in both cost and quality from another organisation (ability to provide a complete active travel package at the same scale, including walking, cycling and placemaking expertise alongside behaviour change);

- The pre-qualification questionnaire and open tendering process would take at least 8-10 weeks and additional council resource;
- Another consultancy would not necessarily have the local connections provided by Sustrans based on their work elsewhere across Essex;
- There is loss of continuity for HGGT if consultants are just a shortterm solution, or if different consultants are brought in for different aspects of the Active Travel packages (e.g. behaviour change, infrastructure design, strategic planning etc.);
- Embedded knowledge within the wider team is not guaranteed following the end of the contract term.

# Re-advertise the job via HGGT website

#### **Benefits**

- Cheapest option due to direct recruitment of one qualified officer;
- The job advertisement has already been through procurement and would just require a repeat of the previous process;
- The candidate would be fully integrated with the other HGGT officers and would be able to sit on workstreams as an HGGT employee;
- Any training or resources or partnership building would stay within the team;

#### **Disadvantages**

- There is no guarantee that recruitment will be more successful this time, after failing to garner any interest in March;
- No access to wider networks, and the candidate would be required to self-motivate regarding training.

# Explore other recruitment routes

# **Benefits**

- Recruiters are incentivised to guarantee delivery of a suitable candidate:
- Access to various recruitment portals wide recruitment field and high profile means recruiters can access skills and talent through potentially unconventional Local Authority routes;
- The procurement process would open out the options to a potentially more competitive pool;
- The candidate would be fully integrated with the other HGGT officers and would be able to sit on workstreams as an HGGT employee;

# Disadvantages

- Recruiters and agencies involve costly overheads;
- There is no guarantee that they would be able to target the right candidates with the experience required for the role;
- An individual could not provide the continuity or wider pool of knowledge and training provided by other host organisations;
- Potential loss of reputation if recruiters don't follow up with applicants in a timely manner.

# Complete this work in-house

# **Benefits**

- There would be no extra financial outlay, however there would be an indirect cost due to staff being diverted from other work;
- No time spent on recruitment or training;
- No increased burdens on HR:
- The candidate would be fully integrated with the other HGGT officers and would be able to sit on workstreams as an HGGT employee;

# Disadvantages

- Staff lack the necessary capacity to undertake the technical studies identified above:
- Given the lack of expertise of in-house staff, the work would take longer to complete, thus risking significant delays to the delivery of the Active Travel programme;
- An individual could not provide the wider pool of knowledge and training provided by other host organisations;
- There's a risk that the work would not be sufficiently robust, and thus increase the risk of the HGGT's sustainability principles not being fully embedded, particularly with regards to behaviour change.